

COMMITTEE REPORT

Date: 15 November 2012 **Ward:** Guildhall
Team: Major and **Parish:** Guildhall Planning Panel
Commercial Team

Reference: 12/02685/FUL
Application at: Central Library Museum Street York YO1 7DS
For: First floor rear/side extension to form new archive repository
and installation of 3.no. roof cowls on existing roof (York
explore Phase II)
By: Mr Charlie Croft
Application Type: Full Application
Target Date: 24 October 2012
Recommendation: Approve

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 The Central Library, Museum Street comprises a substantial brick and stone detailed Grade II Listed early 20th Century example of the work of the local Arts and Crafts architect WH Brierley. It furthermore occupies a prominent location within the Historic Core Conservation Area directly to the north of the City Centre and within the setting of the City Walls a Scheduled Ancient Monument and the Kings Manor a Grade I Listed Building dating from the Medieval period. Full planning permission and a parallel Listed Building Consent (ref:- 12/02686/LBC) is sought for erection of a first floor metal clad extension with fixed link and associated escape stair to house the City Archives at the same time as the existing first floor reference library is refurbished. This represents the second of two phases of work to refurbish the whole building, phase I having focussed on the refurbishment of the lending library and associated meeting spaces.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

Areas of Archaeological Interest GMS Constraints: City Centre Area 0006
Conservation Area GMS Constraints: Central Historic Core CONF
Listed Buildings GMS Constraints: Grade 2; Library Library Square York YO1 2DS
0631

2.2 Policies:

CYHE2 Development in historic locations

CYHE3 Conservation Areas

CYHE4 Listed Buildings

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

INTERNAL:-

3.1 Environmental Protection Unit raise no objection to the proposal.

3.2 Highway Network Management raise no objection to the proposal.

3.3 Strategic Flood Risk Management raise no objection to the proposal.

3.4 Design, Conservation and Sustainable Development raise no objections in principle to the proposal but express concern in respect of the proposed access arrangements to the rear of the extension, the proposed replacement roof membrane, the proposed cctv and the proposed external lighting and signage.

EXTERNAL:-

3.5 English Heritage raise no objection in principle to the proposal.

3.6 Guildhall Planning Panel object to the proposal on the grounds that the proposed extension would have a significantly adverse impact upon the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and the setting of nearby Listed Buildings.

3.7 The York Conservation Areas Advisory Committee raise no objection in principle to the proposal but express some concern in respect of the proposed external construction material.

4.0 APPRAISAL

KEY CONSIDERATIONS:-

4.1 KEY CONSIDERATIONS INCLUDE:-

- * Impact upon the character and appearance of the Conservation Area;
- * Impact upon the setting of nearby grade I and II* listed buildings;
- * Impact upon the setting of the City Walls a Scheduled Ancient Monument.

STATUS OF THE DRAFT LOCAL PLAN:-

4.2 The City of York Development Control Local Plan was approved for Development Control purposes in April 2005; its policies remain material considerations although it is considered that their weight is limited except where they are in accordance with Central Government Planning Policy as outlined in the National Planning Policy Framework.

IMPACT UPON THE CHARACTER AND APPEARANCE OF THE CONSERVATION AREA

4.3 Policy HE3 of the York Development Control Local Plan sets a firm policy presumption that within Conservation Areas proposals for development involving external alterations will only be permitted where there would not be an adverse impact upon the character and appearance of the area. Central Government Planning Policy as outlined in paragraph 131 of the National Planning Policy Framework urges Local Planning Authorities to balance the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of the Conservation Area whilst ensuring that it remains viable and sustainable economically. The desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness is also stressed.

4.4 The Historic Core Conservation Area in the vicinity of the Library comprises a dense pattern of urban development dating back into the Later Medieval period with a mix of shopping, office and leisure uses. The Library building occupies a prominent location within that, at the north western approach to the City Centre. The building itself sits on an island site and is more modest in scale than surrounding properties whilst acting as a visual focal point at the head of the small square leading off Museum Street. The proposed extension would lie at first floor level to the rear of the property on the north-east elevation. Whilst the existing building is an example of early 20th century Neo-Georgian architecture executed in brick with Portland stone detailing, the proposal deliberately chooses a futuristic metaphor using a mix of contemporary metallic cladding materials whilst maintaining the same pattern of scale and massing as the existing building. The principle behind the design seeks to draw attention to the function and use of the extension as the repository of the City's Archives. Concern has been expressed in relation to the proposed cladding material, however its colour, finish and coursing pattern would lead it to blend in closely with the existing building. It is further proposed to incorporate a shadow strip below the proposed extension to differentiate it from the brickwork below, providing it is suitably finished this is considered to be acceptable.

4.5 The proposed extension forms phase 2 of the transformation project to convert the City Central Library in to York Explore by re-locating the City Archives to the site and presenting them in an attractive and easily usable form which will help secure the long term future of the building. It is felt that the proposal would secure the significant contribution of the building to the Conservation Area and that the

contribution of the proposed extension would be broadly positive. The terms of Policy HE3 of the Draft Local Plan and the NPPF have therefore been complied with.

IMPACT UPON THE SETTING OF NEARBY GRADE I AND II* LISTED BUILDINGS

4.6 Policy HE2 of the York Development Control Local Plan sets a firm policy presumption that within or adjoining Conservation Areas and in locations which affect the setting of Listed Buildings or Scheduled Monuments development proposals must respect adjacent buildings, landmarks and settings and have regard to local scale, proportion, detail and materials. Central Government Planning Policy outlined in paragraph 132 of the NPPF urges Local Planning Authority's to give significant weight to the conservation of Heritage Assets including the setting of Listed Buildings and where any harm would be materially significant planning permission should be refused. To the north east of the Central Library lies the Kings Manor a Grade I Listed Building dating from the mid 16th Century with earlier origins. The proposed extension would create a clear visual relationship with the south east gable elevation of the Kings Manor which comprises an early brick form with stone detailing. The proposed extension would in terms of its broad scale, massing and proportion respect the setting of the nearby Listed Building to the north east and not cause material harm.

4.7 The relationship of the extension with the Grade II* buildings at 2-9 St Leonards Place is considered to be acceptable as it faces on to the much altered and extended service elevations.

4.8 The terms of Policy HE2 of the Draft Local Plan and the NPPF have therefore been complied with.

IMPACT UPON THE SETTING OF THE CITY WALLS A SCHEDULED ANCIENT MONUMENT

4.9 The proposed extension lies in close proximity to the City Walls, a Scheduled Ancient Monument directly to the north and north east and the proposal involves ground works to facilitate access to the rear. The relationship of the rear of the extension to the monument which is constructed in stone and which dates to the 13th Century with earlier Roman elements, would be very close especially in respect of the proposed escape stair. Whilst the proposed palette of materials would be both sharp and contemporary the existing pattern of scale and massing would be maintained and the existing vistas of the walls from the surrounding area would not be interrupted. The existing east/west corridor through which the history and development of the walls directly to the north of the site can be understood would be maintained and as a consequence it is not felt that the proposal would materially harm the setting of the Ancient Monument.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 The Central Library, Museum Street comprises a substantial two storey brick and Portland stone constructed Neo Georgian Building Listed as an example of the work of local Arts and Crafts architect W H Brierley. Planning permission and a parallel Listed Building Consent is sought in respect of the erection of a first floor extension as a second phase of the refurbishment of the Library to accommodate the City Archives. A contemporary metaphor incorporating a metallic cladding but reflecting the existing pattern of scale and massing has been chosen to reflect the proposed use and function of the extension. Whilst notably different from the existing design and palette of materials the proposed extension would add a distinctive contribution to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area whilst at the same time securing the role and function of the existing library building. The proposal is therefore felt to be appropriate in planning terms and approval is therefore recommended.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve

1 TIME2 Development start within three years -

2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following plans:-

Drawing Refs:- YO001 4007 P1, YO001 0003 P1, YO001 3004 P1, YO001 3002 P1, YO001 3001 P1, and YO001 2002 P1.

Reason: For the avoidance of doubt and to ensure that the development is carried out only as approved by the Local Planning Authority.

3 VISQ8 Samples of exterior materials to be app -

4 VISQ7 Sample panel ext materials to be approve -

5 Large scale details of the items listed below shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development and the works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details.

i) The roof level fall arrest system,

ii) The external works to facilitate disabled access to the rear entrance.

Reason: So that the Local Planning Authority may be satisfied with these details.

Application Reference Number: 12/02685/FUL

Item No: 4i

6 Notwithstanding the application details hereby approved full details of the external lighting and cctv cameras to be installed shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority before work on site commences including size, design and location of fittings. The development shall thenceforth be undertaken in strict accordance with the details thereby approved.

Reason:-To safeguard the character and appearance of the Conservation Area and to secure compliance with Policies HE2 and HE3 of the York Development Control Local Plan.

7.0 INFORMATIVES: Notes to Applicant

1. REASON FOR APPROVAL

In the opinion of the Local Planning Authority the proposal, subject to the conditions listed above, would not cause undue harm to interests of acknowledged importance, with particular reference to impact upon the character and appearance of the Historic Core Conservation Area, impact upon the setting of nearby Grade I and II* Listed Buildings and impact upon the setting of the City Walls, a Scheduled Ancient Monument. As such the proposal complies with Policies HE2, HE3 and HE4 of the City of York Development Control Local Plan.

Contact details:

Author: Erik Matthews Development Management Officer
Tel No: 01904 551416